

Cultural Diversity in Middle Horizon Wari

Mortuary Practices, Ceramic Styles, and Religious Experience

William H. Isbell

Key words

Andean archaeology, Wari, cultural diversity, ceramic styles, mortuary practices

1. Introduction

Archaeology of cultural variability during Peru's Middle Horizon (approximately A.D. 650 – 1000; henceforth, MH) has focused on questions about the nature of Wari.¹ Especially, if the material diagnostics of the MH identify an ancient political formation, should that polity be understood as an archaic empire ruled from the capital city of Huari, in Peru's Ayacucho Valley? In a career-capping evaluation of MH diversity and Wari political organization Richard Schaedel (1993) discussed diverse regional traditions whose distinctive iconic imageries were judged inconsistent with enforced change he associated with an imperial state. Schaedel argued that even the concept of horizon was inappropriate given the cultural and political diversity apparent in the archaeological record. However, the issue of cultural diversity in the MH is much more complex than enforced culture change, or the question, "Was Wari an empire?" Cultural variation is a dynamic part of complex polities, not just the remains of pre-imperial ethnicities that have not been homogenized into the core state. In his influential definition of archaic imperialism Thomas Barfield (2001: 29 [emphasis in the original]; also quoted by Glatz 2013: 21) pointed out that "*empires are organized both to administer and exploit diversity, whether economic, political, religious, or ethnic.*" It is time that we examine cultural diversity within Wari and the MH, determine what processes were involved, and what these differences meant for the Wari dominion.

Cities that for the first time became wide-spread during Peru's MH harbor and incite cultural diversity (Smith 2003). They foster direct and indirect contacts between residents

¹ I employ the spelling "Huari" to refer to the principal site, and capital city of the expansionist state centered in the Ayacucho Valley during the MH – as well as objects and artifacts from the capital. I employ the spelling "Wari" to refer to the culture and styles spread from the capital city of Huari during the MH – as well as the objects and artifacts from locations outside the capital city. Consequently, pottery of the Chakipampa Style from the capital belongs to Huari culture, while Chakipampa Style pottery from the city of Conchopata belongs to Wari culture. I use the same convention for "Tiahuanaco," the Titicaca Lake shore site, and "Tiwanaku," the wide-spread culture.

and among visitors who would be very unlikely ever to encounter one another in traditional village life. Imperial urban centers should be understood as petri dishes where cultural diversity could originate and flourish. But there were surely many sources of diversity, including ethnogenesis, new gender categories, emerging status groups, and other identities in the rapidly changing social landscape. In this chapter we will examine the archaeology of MH Peru to determine how heterogeneous cultural practice was. While the recent archaeological image of Wari imperial centralization has been the imposition of cultural homogenization, new understandings of empire pose the question of what kinds of diversity were allowed, and perhaps even encouraged by the Wari polity.

This paper explores three domains of cultural diversity during the MH, not to affirm the classificatory designation of Empire, but to better understand Wari itself. I believe that the identities materialized by archaeological remains discussed herein were internal to the Wari imagined community (Isbell 2000; Yeager & Canuto 2000). That is, none of the materialized identities appear to have opposed themselves to Wari cultural, political or ethnic identities. All the participants in each of the dimensions of cultural variation explored would probably have self-identified as ‘Wari,’ at least in the contexts materialized by the archaeological remains discussed. Undoubtedly, the people surely participated in multiple and alternative identities, but I do not think that any of them excluded identification as Wari. The cultural domains selected for discussion are as follows:

- 1) Mortuary practices in the heartland and peripheries, especially the central coast
- 2) Variation in heartland ceramic styles: chronology and social factionalism
- 3) Experience of the supernatural as implied by images of an hallucinogenic plant in religious iconography

2. MH Mortuary Practices

The burial preference identifiable as the Wari mortuary ideal is flexed and seated interment in a subterranean pit or stone-lined chamber (Isbell 2004; Isbell & Korpisaari 2012). Corpses were interred with their legs drawn up against the chest, with arms encircling or resting on the knees. Bodies appear to have been placed in their tombs in a seated position, although poor preservation in the highlands often results in the skeleton falling over, or collapsing into a heap.

Flexed burial appears to have been the practice in Wari’s Ayacucho heartland before the MH, although it is not clear that seated posture was also preferred (Lumbreras 1969, 1974; see also Leoni 2010). Be that as it may, body position for burial in the core Wari territory changed only modestly through the Early Intermediate Period (approximately 200 B.C. – A.D. 650; henceforth EIP) and into the MH (Leoni 2009, 2010). By contrast, on much of the coast of Peru, ancient traditions of extended burial dominated mortuary practice throughout the EIP, only to be replaced by tightly flexed corpses during the MH. Although more details

of the transformations are required, both north coast and central coast burial patterns underwent radical conversion (Donnan & Mackey 1978: 213; Flores 2005; Flores *et al.* 2012; Moseley 1992: 216). South coast burial preferences also reveal modification in favor of Wari standards, but tightly flexed interment had been practiced on the south coast since at least the beginning of the EIP (Carmichael 1988) so transformations associated with the arrival of Wari influence were less drastic than farther north along the coast.

Archaeologists ask whether the apparently wide-spread adoption of a more or less uniform burial practice throughout so much of MH Peru reveals a distinct new mortuary canon, that may have been imposed by the Wari Empire. But how uniform were the new burial practices? More significantly, can MH mortuary changes be attributed to a universal new religious ideology, and if so, was it propagated by Wari?

In Peru's north coastal valleys a millennium-old Moche cultural preference for extended burial was replaced by flexed interments during the MH (Donnan & Mackey 1978). In the Lima area of the central coast cemeteries of dorsally extended bodies characterize the EIP, but MH adult graves are usually tightly flexed and seated (Flores 2005: 71-78; Rengifo 2006, 2007). In view of similarity in form as well as in the timing of profound mortuary changes both in the north and central coastal regions, a single Wari explanation is appealing. However, it seems very unlikely that enforced culture change of the kind Schaedel (1993) associated with empire, could have been involved – at least on the north coast. Most Central Andean prehistorians agree that the Moche polities of the north coast were not subjugated by Wari, so if flexed interment does represent a Wari introduction, its adoption among the former Moche peoples must have been voluntary.

Central coastal, Lima-area burials are especially informative about MH mortuary preferences. Dry conditions on Peru's central coast preserve artifacts seldom recovered in the highlands, or even north coast mortuary contexts, so MH graves from the Lima region are among the most detailed, and well-preserved, of the Wari realm. Lima-area MH burials consist of cloth-wrapped mummies capped by false heads complete with facial features. In at least the larger mummies, a substantial bale of cloth encloses the tightly flexed body. Cloth constituting the mummy bundle includes items of clothing that are often gender- and age-specific, and show signs of wear. The bundles also include ornaments, apparently placed within the wrappings as offerings, and raw vegetable material to increase the size of the bundle (Angeles 2018; Angeles & Pozzi-Escot 2000, 2001; Flores *et al.* 2012; Jijon y Camaaño 1949; Pozzi-Escot & Angeles 2011; Reiss & Stübel 1998 [1880-1887]). Bales are frequently bound and stabilized with rope and surmounted with a false head of cloth embroidered with facial details, or of wood with carved features sometimes enhanced by hair, inlays of shell, and semi-precious materials.

Graves range from simple holes in the ground, containing a single body, to stone- or adobe-lined sepulchers sometimes containing numerous mummies. Flores *et al.* (2012: 21) report a Wari grave from Huaca Pucllana with 11 mummies. Furthermore, there seems to have been a hierarchy among the mummies of these multi-individual tombs. The largest,

primary mummy was seated against the south wall, facing north or east, with one or more companions of similar, but somewhat less, elaborate construction. Offerings of pottery, tools, and other artifacts were placed on the floor of the tomb, sometimes rather clearly associated with one or the other of the mummies. Pucllana multi-individual graves sometimes included children's bodies, probably offerings for these cadavers were extended, not wrapped in bales, and they have no false heads.

One of the finest Wari tunics ever discovered came from a large mummy excavated from a multi-individual tomb at Ancon in 1875 (Reiss & Stübel 1998 [1880-1887]: Plates 16 and 49). The spectacular textile covered a large mummy bundle more or less typical of Lima-area Wari burials, except that the nucleus of the bale consisted of disarticulated human bones wrapped into a packet, therefor representing a secondary burial rather than the more typical tightly-flexed body. The condition of the remarkable tunic also indicates recycling. Together the reuse of the tunic and the secondary burial of the bones document re-opening graves, and prolonged mortuary ritual for at least some Lima-area Wari dead. Furthermore, it seems likely that all multi-individual tombs were re-opened so new bodies and perhaps offerings could be added over time. It is also likely that objects within the graves, including human remains, were manipulated before the re-opened tomb was sealed again. What is unclear is how frequently and for what broader purpose Wari tombs were re-opened. As discussed below, re-opening tombs, manipulating mummies, and interactions between the living and dead are immensely important issues in ethnohistoric Andean religion and social structure. We will revisit the issue of re-opening tombs to evaluate similarities and differences between MH mummies and Inca ancestor mummies reported in the 16th century (Isbell 1997, 2004; Isbell & Korpisaari 2014).

On Peru's south coast mortuary practices also reveal change during the MH, although not as radical as in Peru's north coast or Lima-area cemeteries, where extended burial was replaced by flexed interment. South coast burial practice preferred tightly flexed interments in cloth-wrapped bales throughout the EIP, so change was less dramatic. However, with few exceptions, EIP south coast dead were interred one to a grave (Carmichael 1988). With the onset of the MH, multiple-individual tombs became popular, albeit they were never the majority of the burials. Rectangular stone- or adobe-lined tombs roofed with heavy wooden beams were accessed by deep shafts. They contained several tightly flexed mummy bales, with ornate false heads (Silverman & Proulx 2002: 276). Carmichael (1988: 357-358, plates 1, 2) illustrates an example of a diagnostically EIP-MH transition tomb excavated at Cahuachi, that contained a man's body, and three other adults as well as a child under one of the other mummies. Pottery offerings of the Nasca 8 style reveal prototypic Chakipampa style influence from Ayacucho, representing a very early stage in the development of Wari pottery. Significantly, the mummy bales were placed so that free space remained in the square chamber at the bottom of the grave shaft, seemingly to anticipate the insertion of yet more cadavers. This led Carmichael to infer that the sepulcher probably represented the tomb of a family group, to which members were added as they died.

Wari mortuary activates in the Ayacucho heartland, as well as other highland locations, are significantly less well known than the coastal cemeteries. First, there has been much less excavation in the highlands than along the coast. Second, preservation of perishable remains is poor in the seasonally rainy highlands. Third, although probably no worse than on the coast, looting has severely damaged Wari tombs, especially the more elite examples.

The first elite Wari tomb to be discovered intact, and excavated by professional archaeologists in the highlands, occurred only in 2011, at Vilcabamba, Cusco (Fonseca Santa Cruz 2011). Given the scarcity of undisturbed elite burial contexts in the highlands, archaeologists frequently resort to characterizing highland Wari tombs on the basis of analogies with better known and more intensively studied coastal MH graves – especially central coast graves. However, since this approach enhances the impression of a universal Wari mortuary practice, we must pose another question. Were highland Wari, and particularly heartland Ayacucho Wari burials great cloth-wrapped mummy bales with false heads, like those of the central coast? Furthermore, did post-mortem treatment of coastal and highland mummy bales resemble Inca ancestor worship?

The first question opens a series of inquiries. If we are to evaluate how influential highland Wari mortuary practice was in reshaping coastal burial preferences during the MH we must determine how similar adult interments really were from one region to the other. If the answer is that a single MH mode of interment was spread throughout the Wari realm, does that document a shared religious ideology that required specific treatment for the deceased? And to the degree that these questions can be answered in the affirmative, what educated guesses can be proposed about the contents of a new Wari ideology of death?

The second issue outlined above is also very important because the large, primary mummy bales from coastal MH cemeteries resemble Inca ancestor mummies – well-preserved, desiccated cadavers bound in a tightly flexed position, carefully dressed in elegant clothing, and seated on a stool or litter so they could be viewed and venerated by their progeny (Guaman Poma [1615] 1980; Isbell 1997). Inca ancestor mummies were the most immediate object of religious veneration for ethnic Incas as well as for many peoples incorporated into the Inca Empire in the 16th century. The mummies were offered food and other sacrificial goods, including new clothing in which the body was regularly dressed, in a continuing effort by descendants to win supernaturally-granted favors through the deceased ancestor who acted as intermediary between the living and more distant bearers of divine powers.

Inca ancestors apparently had to remain corporeal if they were to retain spiritual identity, so they were not buried but carefully kept protected from humidity and depredation in a variety of open sepulchers. Within these lodgings the ancestors could be visited, consulted and worshipped. They were also removed from the open sepulcher and carried abroad on litters to participate in rituals (MacCormack 1991: 77), to host fellow ancestors, and to manage their earthly estates.

Inca ancestor mummies administered the resources they had accumulated in life, communicating decisions through intermediaries as well as divination. Secure in the open sepulcher, founder mummies were often accompanied by corpses of their relatives, especially primary and secondary sons, but apparently also spouses and more distant kin. As founder of the family estate, the apical ancestor mummy was the nexus of the Andean corporate descent group, the *ayllu*, that was a building block for Inca Cusco, as well as broader imperial organization. Some archaeologists argue that Inca-style ancestor mummies, Inca-style ancestor worship, and Inca-style *ayllu* organization can be attributed to Wari and the Middle Horizon (see for example McEwan 2005). To the degree that they are correct Wari was the absolute antecedent of the Inca Empire, if not its origin. If true, it could be argued that the spread of Wari mortuary practices represents the initial diffusion of Inca-style social and ideological institutions through the Andean world, a millennium before actual Inca expansion. However, many problems remain to be resolved before Wari heartland mortuary practices are understood, meaning that it is premature to equate MH burial practices of the central or south coast with the Wari highlands, or any of those with Inca ancestor worship and its associated *ayllu* organization.

First, is the question of whether Peruvian coastal mortuary practices of the MH – for example burials from the Lima area – were introduced from the Wari heartland. Second, to what degree do coast and highland practices represent a unified pattern that can be associated with Ayacucho Wari? Third is the question of whether MH mummy bales document ancestor worship of the kind practiced by the Incas, in which the *ayllu* kin group affirmed itself through ritualized adoration of an apical ancestor by his/her descendants – real and apparently fictional. Since each question is predicated on its antecedent, we must begin with the first.

Does the interment of large cloth-wrapped mummy bales with false heads, in hierarchically organized, multi-individual tombs, along with the other practices characteristic of the Lima coast also characterize Ayacucho Wari mortuary preferences? Which of the coastal practices appear in the highland archaeological record, and in what ways was interment in MH Ayacucho different from coastal practices?

Before we embark on a comparative discussion of Ayacucho Wari mortuary preferences, we must determine how interment differed in accord with social status. There can be little doubt that the multi-individual tombs on which Lima-area and other coastal Wari burial patterns are currently understood represent elite interments. Less elaborate burials also exist, but the range of variation has not been synthesized into a systematic and classificatory statement about MH mortuary preferences on the central and neighboring coasts. What can be affirmed is that the materials chosen for description represent the finer tombs that surely belonged to local elites.

In Ayacucho Wari, immense differences have been observed in graves, suggesting as many as 8 degrees of social inequality were expressed in the elaboration of tombs (Isbell 2004; Isbell & Korpisaari 2012; Leoni 2009). Although the sample is small, the upper two

levels of the heartland interment hierarchy are both monumental and megalithic graves that occur only at the Huari capital. They probably represent the tombs of kings and high nobility, respectively. Similar tombs are not found at MH centers subsidiary to Huari, neither in the highlands nor on the coast.

The next echelon of tombs includes several variants of non-monumental Mortuary Room Interment, that are known at Huari as well as the secondary city of Conchopata, and provincial Wari centers such as Huaru's Batan Urqo (Zapata 1998) and Espíritu Pampa (Fonseca Santa Cruz 2011) in Cusco. A less elaborate grave type, but still surely elite, is the Bedrock Cavity Tomb described for Ayacucho's Conchopata, Azángaro and Ñawinpukyo (Anders 1986; Isbell 2004; Isbell & Korpisaari 2012; Leoni 2009, 2010), but more wide-spread. A simpler tomb type was Cist Interment, probably for common folk, and several varieties of simple pit burials probably represent Wari poor – perhaps servants and captives. I believe that the best comparison for the multi-individual tombs, containing large mummy bales with false heads and elaborate textile wrappings, from Lima and other coastal areas is with non-monumental Mortuary Room Interments, and perhaps Bedrock Cavity Tombs, of the highlands. Both appear to represent local elites, and they share important features – especially the *ttoco*, described below. These tombs therefore constitute the basis for describing the Wari heartland tradition that will be compared with the elite MH Wari burials from elsewhere, especially the central coast. At both Conchopata and Ñawinpukyo several of the modest elite interment contexts, as well as more common pit burials, contain traces of textiles and cordage. There seems little doubt that at least some bodies were wrapped in cloth and bound with rope, but were they great bales like those of the coast?

One salient difference between Ayacucho and Lima MH mortuary remains is that burials in Ayacucho are typically found in, or under the floors of habitation sites. This is clearly documented at Conchopata, the most extensively excavated MH city where more than 200 interments have been recovered (Isbell 2001; Isbell & Cook 2002; Tung 2012). Mortuary remains from Huari follow a similar pattern. Separate cemeteries were not popular in the MH Ayacucho highlands (except for caves, discussed below); space was devoted to the dead within residential communities. To the contrary, in the Lima region, MH burials are primarily in cemeteries. Most frequently these cemeteries are intruded into, or along the edge of, old platform complexes such as Huaca Pucllana, Maranga, Cajamarquilla, Pachacamac, or Huaca Malena, all ceremonial centers occupied during the EIP and abandoned at the onset of the MH. Furthermore, even when MH Wari-style burials do not take advantage of earlier ceremonial platforms, they still occur in cemetery groupings, as at Ancon.

Highland burial contexts that might be considered MH cemeteries are in caves, although none have been discovered intact, so it is difficult to determine the original conditions and dates for these rock-shelter mausoleums. Extrapolating from disturbed remains – bits of cloth-wrapped mummies with no evidence for false heads, copious human bones, and occasional scraps of fine textiles – numerous individual mummy bundles must have been

placed side by side on the floor of the cave, on shelf-like ledges, or in niches. At least some bundles were wrapped with Wari-style textiles, among them tapestry tunics with face and fret designs, and occasionally even more elaborate icons. In at least some cases the interior of the cave was partitioned with stone and clay walls, and the external opening was sealed by a wall that was plastered and painted red, leaving only a small opening like a window. If mummy bundles inside were passed through this kind of opening, as seems unavoidable, none could have been as substantial and bulky as the primary bales of central coastal tombs. However, cave burials do represent something of a cemetery-like context from the highlands in that the human remains were not placed below the floors of individual residences, but together in large groupings. Some caves probably contained several groups of dead.

There is no evidence for false heads on Ayacucho highland mummy bundles, except for one shell object that could have been an eye-inlay for a carved wooden false head, found in a Mortuary Room Interment chamber at Conchopata. A paradoxical case is the Espiritu Pampa elite grave with a silver mask, and other metallic objects, that were discovered in the tomb. The mask is a solid sheet, with eyes indicated by repoussé, but no openings that would have allowed a wearer to see. Around the edge of the mask are holes that imply that it was sewed on a cloth or basketry support. On the back of the mask archaeologists discovered human tissue, including some teeth that upon analysis turned out to belong to a young man (Fonseca Santa Cruz 2011). One might argue that the mask was sewn to a mummy bundle, making a false face similar to coastal heads of wood or cloth. However, the presence of human flesh adhering to the back of the mask implies that it was worn directly over the face of the deceased, so it was probably not a false face on the outside of a mummy bundle. Indeed, was there a significant wrapping of textiles over this body at all? Many highland stone-lined graves are small, and could not have held a great cloth-wrapped bale like those of the coast. The situation is perplexing, and satisfactory explanation continues to elude archaeologists.

Some Andean prehistorians suggest that face neck jars, so popular in the Wari ceramic tradition, represent Wari ancestors, and therefore, perhaps, mummies with heads or faces. Indeed, they look a good deal like coastal mummy bales with false heads at the top. Be that as it may, evidence for heartland Wari mummy bundles with false heads is not conclusive, either positive or negative. More information will have to be collected, but in the meantime, it is more secure to answer that false heads are unlikely on highland mummies.

Highland Wari Mortuary Room burials, at least those that have not been too severely damaged by looters seem to have had a principal burial. Sometimes this is a primary burial chamber surrounded by smaller and more modest chambers. In other cases, it is a large chamber with several skeletons one of which may have had more offerings than others. Unfortunately, the lack of textile bundles makes evaluation more difficult than among elite tombs from the Lima area. However, given current information, it does seem likely that coastal and highland multi-individual tombs were similar in containing one primary and several secondary bodies.

Coastal tombs of the MH were probably opened and re-opened. One situation that seems to have required re-opening was the addition of a new body. This is implied by a tomb from Cahuachi, Nasca, in which bodies were carefully placed to leave space for additional mummies (Carmichael 1988). Secondary burial of a packet of human bones in a bale covered by a recycled Wari tunic, at Ancon, implies other conditions for re-opening graves as well (Reiss & Stübel 1998 [1880-1887]). While we do not know what was involved in the sustained celebrations of death among coastal people of the MH, it seems unlikely that deceased bodies were completely removed from contact with the living by entombment soon after death, as appears to have been preferred in antecedent Andean cultures such as Nasca and Lima as well as the MH interments of Tiahuanaco. A new attitude toward the deceased seems to have been introduced during the MH, and it seems probable that it was closely linked to Wari.

At Conchopata and elsewhere in the Ayacucho highlands Wari bodies also continued to participate in the world of the living. One collective tomb from Conchopata was opened several times, probably as new bodies were added, but some of the bones of earlier burials seem to have been removed as well – apparently disarticulated bones, not entire bodies, and not cloth-wrapped mummy bales. However, these Wari tombs were constructed to permit another kind of interaction between living and dead, less direct, though a hole in the lid, or ceiling of the tomb. Such openings, usually only about 10 cm in diameter appear to have been used to pass small luxury items into the grave, such as beads and pieces of *Spondylus* shell. However, they could have had other functions as well, that would not leave obvious material traces, such as spoken communication, or offerings of food and drink. Provisionally named ‘*ttoco*,’ small openings into Wari tombs are known at Conchopata, Huari, Espíritu Pampa, Huaro, and perhaps Marcaconga across the valley from Pomacanchi, Cusco (see Chávez 1987). *Ttoco* have not been reported for Lima-area burials, identifying an important difference between the Wari heartland, including Ayacucho and Cusco, and coastal Wari burial. Clearly MH mortuary patterns were not homogeneous, even among regions that experienced significant Wari influence. Also, of importance, Leoni (2010) argues on the basis of a small sample of late EIP burials from Ñawinpukyo that *ttoco* were absent in this Ayacucho community as well. Perhaps the *ttoco* is a very specific diagnostic of heartland Wari mortuary preference exclusive to the MH, although it may be that the lack of *ttoco* at Ñawinpukyo is an index of low status rather than time.

While coastal Wari tombs were re-opened at least on certain occasions, there is no evidence that the mummies were removed and transported to public rituals as with Inca ancestor mummies. While such activities cannot be discounted altogether, the difficulty of opening many of the coastal MH tombs seems to discount public appearances by ancestor mummies, that were very frequent among the Incas. Similarly, living-dead interaction in the Ayacucho highlands seems to have taken place through the *ttoco* at least much of the time. It would have been difficult to remove mummies from some variants of the Mortuary Room Interments. Indeed, what are probably early Mortuary Room Interments have a principal

burial chamber with heavy lid pierced by a *ttoco*, that was covered by a little offering house built over the lid, and often resting on its edges. Removing the lid would have required the destruction of the offering house, so subsidiary burials usually surround the primary mortuary chamber and offering house, instead of being placed in the same re-opened grave.

As currently interpreted at Conchopata, variation in Mortuary Room Interment experienced formal change which led to a late tomb type with more easily re-opened chamber, probably in the final century or so of the MH (Isbell 2004). If this chronology is correct, it is possible that public appearances by mummies increased in the final generations of Wari and the MH. Indeed, burial practices of the MH should not be imagined as static, or characterized by a single and unchanging pattern of Wari mortuary activity. However, it seems that removable stone “doors” of late, re-openable Mortuary Room Interment chambers sealed entrances that were small, through which the ingress and egress of mummy bundles would have been difficult, even mummy bundles significantly smaller than the great coastal bales.

In relation to long-term participation of mummies in public activities of the living, the capacity of a tomb to preserve human remains becomes critical. While no evaluation has been made for the capacity of typical coastal Wari graves to preserve human bodies, the exceptional preservation frequently observed on the central and south coasts seems to have resulted from dry environmental conditions, not special milieus created by tombs, and apparently not any attempts at embalming the corpses. In the highlands as well, there is no evidence for systematic efforts to preserve human bodies during the MH. Dry caves made for excellent preservation of human remains, but the visibility of these mausoleums, and the preservation of textile and other offerings promoted looting, that has destroyed almost everything. The rock-lined and stone-capped underground graves that were popular at Conchopata and other Wari sites are notoriously poor for preservation. They apparently encourage damp interiors through condensation of moisture on the stone ceilings of the graves. Better preservation of human remains required free-standing, above-ground chambers that avoided the humidity of the soil, an innovation that began in late Wari, but is most clearly associated with *chullpa* burial, probably somewhat later in time.

3. Ceramic Styles: Chronology and Social Factionalism

Dorothy Menzel is an outstanding analyst of pottery who defined ceramic style as “a pattern of decorative features that contrasts with other such patterns both descriptively and in its archaeological associations” (Menzel 1964: 75, footnote 5). More significantly, she employed the ceramic style to infer a period of time when a group of people manufactured and used that style. Indeed, since the origin of professional archaeology Central Andean prehistory has assumed the existence of an ancient time period on the basis of a distinguishable ceramic style with distinguishable archaeological associations (Kroeber 1925, 1944; Rowe 1945, 1962; Uhle 1903a, 1903b).

In 1964 Menzel published the first installment of one of the most important chronologies of the Andean past, her monumental seriation of MH pottery, establishing a relative chronology that has been the “gold standard” for 50 years. In 1968 and 1977 she expanded and refined that chronology, adding new information, but following the same temporal framework as well as the same theory and assumptions (Menzel 1964, 1968, 1977). One of Menzel’s key assumptions is that stylistic change is based primarily on unintentional, behavioristic processes that take place over time. Second, she believes that archaeologists can work out the sequence of change using logical evaluation of formal similarities among artifacts from numerous archaeologically associated contexts, each believed to represent a brief moment in time – especially grave lots and carefully selected excavation contexts, but also including surface collections of sherds from carefully defined sites, or sections of sites.

Creation of different time periods for distinct styles in the Andean past has sometimes been based on no more than a distinguishable style that seems logically earlier or later than another, and at least sometimes comes from separate associational contexts. Temporal periods formulated on this kind of evidence include Uhle’s (1903b) assertion that the MH ceramics he named “Epigonal” belonged to a later time period than the ceramics he identified as “Tiahuanaco Style.” Wendell Bennett (1934) also created different periods of time for styles he named “Classic Tiahuanaco” and “Decadent Tiahuanaco.” Today, radiocarbon dates do not confirm temporal separation of these ceramic styles, that appear to have been contemporary or significantly overlapping in time. Archaeologists continue to debate the Tiwanaku chronology, with many prehistorians arguing that the differences between Classic and Decadent Tiahuanaco (which correlate with current styles called Tiwanaku 1 and 2; see Janusek 2008) were not exclusively temporal but cultural in that they represent ancient expressions of social factionalism. This more recent explanation is based on an agency approach to stylistic variation rather than behavioristic assumptions (Dobres & Robb 2000; Gell 1998). However, long-standing stylistic and chronological convictions continue to shape thinking about time in the Andean past, including the MH.

Before discussing issues of time versus social axes of variation in Menzel’s MH chronology, we must recount a brief history of its development, and describe the chronology itself. It is well to remember that the 1964 MH chronology was not without antecedents, and earlier discussions certainly had their influences. During the latter decades of the early 20th century, diagnostic artifacts of the MH in Peru were called “Coast Tiahuanaco.” The Bolivian center of Tiahuanaco, that gave its name to the entire style was considered the original source of Coast Tiahuanaco art and culture. Furthermore, it was believed that as Tiwanaku culture spread from its Lake Titicaca heartland, overwhelming numerous societies, it melded with local traditions, creating many regional and temporal variations that altered Coast Tiahuanaco culture as it spread (Means 1931). The dynamics of the diffusion were not well understood, although in at least some cases where old ceramic styles were suddenly replaced by new ones, dramatic processes such as military conquest seemed to be implied (Kroeber 1944).

In the 1940s a new Coast Tiahuanaco center was identified in the highland Ayacucho Valley. In 1942 investigations by Julio C. Tello, director of Peru's National Museum of Anthropology, took place at the two largest sites, Huari, and Conchopata. Publication was limited to newspaper-type announcements of discoveries that highlighted Tello's assertion that polychrome Coast Tiahuanaco pottery of the Peruvian littoral – as well as some other important coastal ceramic styles – must have originated in and spread from the Ayacucho center (Tello 1942). Tello's insights were soon examined by a trio of American archaeologists (Rowe, Collier & Willey 1950) who visited the great center of Huari and published a scholarly evaluation of the remains, including fancy pottery collected from the surface.

In 1950 Wendell Bennett (1953) excavated 15 cuts at Huari, and concluded with the argument that the pottery was not just another version of Coast Tiahuanaco. Although clearly related to Tiwanaku, it was a distinct Peruvian variant with its own more or less unified style that differed significantly from Bolivian Tiwanaku. He proposed that this northern Tiwanaku style be called "Peruvian Tiahuanaco" but it came to be known instead as Wari. A few years later John Rowe (1956) documented a frontier, with no man's land, separating the distribution of Wari-style pottery in the north from Tiwanaku-ceramic styles to the south. Two separate polities were indicated for the MH, and liberal archaeologists began to speak about a Wari Empire in Peru (Lumbreras 1959, 1960, 1969; Menzel 1964).

During the late 1950s two archaeology teams were investigating Ayacucho. Luis G. Lumbreras directed activities for the University of San Marcos, and subsequently for the local University of Huamanga. He published a detailed study of ceramics collected at Huari as well as important syntheses of the regional prehistory (Lumbreras 1960; see also Lumbreras 1969, 1974). Pottery excavated at Conchopata in 1961 by Lumbreras' team was described by Mario Benavides C. (1965), who formulated a chronology for the site based on a type-variety classification and quantitative ceramic seriation.

During the same years Dorothy Menzel and John Rowe reconnoitered Ayacucho, carefully distinguishing several archaeological sites, and sectors of sites, from which they collected samples of pottery, especially the fancy polychrome materials. Their goal was to identify ceramic styles (not types) that constituted associational isolates. For each such style a distinct time period was inferred. Using the Ayacucho surface collections as samples of local stylistic variation that endured only briefly, Menzel worked out an outline of stylistic changes into which additional ceramic features could be inserted from other associated collections that shared diagnostic attributes with the initial collection (Menzel 1964). Bennett's (1953) Huari excavations provided valuable samples, as did a spectacular collection of ceramics excavated by Julio C. Tello (1942) at the site of Conchopata. Eventually numerous grave lots and excavation samples from the coast of Peru were also interpolated into the developing chronology.

The spectacular ceramic collection excavated by Julio C. Tello is particularly important to the history of the MH chronology, for it linked Wari to Tiwanaku. Menzel and Rowe were

never able to pinpoint the exact location of Tello's Conchopata excavations. Preferring to err on the side of too many associational contexts than too few, they defined another site a short distance to the north of the supposed location, which they named Chakipampa.² This large area of ruins, subsequently devastated by the construction of an airport, and other developments, was surface collected in subdivisions that are not published, but ceramics from the Chakipampa site define the Chakipampa Style as well as the Ocros Style that are the primary pottery diagnostics of MH Epoch 1. Sherds from the site of Acuchimay, several km to the southwest, represent an association with less stylistic variation, assigned to the early half of the phase, MH Epoch 1A, while ceramics collected from a small site named Totorilla represent the late part of the phase, MH Epoch 1B. Using these associations, Menzel was able to separate the rich Chakipampa site collection into two phases, MH Epoch 1A and MH Epoch 1B. The chronological markers were then used to date objects from other contexts throughout the Wari realm, and to gradually expand the stylistic contents of Epochs 1A and 1B, respectively.

Menzel realized that the spectacular ceramics excavated at Conchopata some years earlier depicted polychrome-painted images of the deities carved on stone sculptures at the Lake Titicaca center of Tiahuanaco. She re-studied Tello's fragments, or at least some of them, reconstructing many of the images, but she was misinformed about their excavation context. She believed that the all sherds had come from stone-walled subterranean rooms that contained nothing but fragments from the oversize vessels³ (Menzel 1968: 95-86, footnote 4). She also observed that all pieces came from the same kind of giant urns that had been smashed deliberately by blows to the religious images themselves. Absence of other pottery styles in the carefully prepared chambers convinced her that the elaborate pottery represented a special ceremonial style that was reserved for sacrificial activities, that was also rigorously separated from all other activities, including anything involving fancy secular ceramics. Lacking formal elements of design that linked this ceremonial Conchopata offering pottery to regular-size MH pottery in her surface collections,⁴ Menzel violated the methodology she normally professed, and assumed that the association of spectacular oversize pottery expressed social rather than temporal determinates. Falling back on the era of Coast Tiahuanaco thinking, she placed the Conchopata style at the beginning of the MH – Epoch 1A – contemporary with the onset of the Chakipampa style. In her seriation, Tiahuanaco influence initiated the stylistic changes that defined the MH, and sparked

² Isbell (1987) showed that the Conchopata site where Tello excavated the giant urns was within the larger site that Menzel and Rowe denominated Chakipampa. Today archaeologists have returned to the first name, Conchopata.

³ On the basis of new excavations at Conchopata I suspect that the oversize offering sherds were collected selectively during 1942 excavations, and perhaps for that reason Menzel concluded that secular pottery did not occur in the same contexts as the ceremonial ware.

⁴ It is not entirely true that there were no Conchopata Style features to cross-date with regular MH ceramic styles from Ayacucho. Knobloch (1983) pointed out that the quality of polychrome painting and surface treatments of Conchopata pottery does not appear in the stratigraphy she analyzed from Huari until MH Epoch 1B. Consequently, she argued that the ceremonial Conchopata pottery was best dated to Epoch 1B.

cultural developments responsible for the rapid rise of Wari. There was no associational basis for this decision.

The rest of Menzel's chronological decisions rigorously followed her methodology. She divided the MH into 4 epochs labeled MH Epoch 1 through MH Epoch 4. The first two epochs were further subdivided into Epoch 1A and 1B, and into Epoch 2A and 2B. MH 3 and 4 were too poorly known to be further refined during the time of Menzel's studies, and they remain poorly understood to this day. A current consensus about dating Menzel's MH chronology, based on numerous radiocarbon determinations, is more or less as follows:

Middle Horizon	Epoch 4	Cal. A.D. 950-1000
Middle Horizon	Epoch 3	Cal. A.D. 900-950
Middle Horizon	Epoch 2B	Cal. A.D. 850-900
Middle Horizon	Epoch 2A	Cal. A.D. 800-850
Middle Horizon	Epoch 1B	Cal. A.D. 700-800
Middle Horizon	Epoch 1A	Cal. A.D. 650-700

Based primarily on her surface collections of ceramics, Menzel concluded that the Chakipampa (or Conchopata) site must have been abandoned at the end of MH Epoch 1 – so about Cal. A.D. 800. Later pottery does not occur at the site. Middle Horizon 2 pottery was defined on the basis of ceramic collections from Huari, especially the contents of Bennett's Pit 2 that contained almost exclusively ceramics attributed to the Viñaque, and the Geometric on Light Styles, along with a couple of minor Epoch 2 styles. Menzel's Huari surface collections from what she termed the main ruins south of the defense wall also yielded virtually exclusively MH 2 pottery. Distinctions based on these associated samples were correlated and cross-dated with excavation lots from contexts across the Wari imperial sphere, demonstrating new influence from the capital in many regional styles, and helping to confirm the seriation that established the second major chronological epoch, MH 2. In 1968 Menzel refined her chronology for Epoch 2, based on newly published information, distinguishing Epochs 2A and 2B. In 1977 she published a re-study of Uhle's collections housed at the Lowie Museum at the University of California Berkeley, providing even more chronological insights about the MH.

Based on her stylistic analyses Menzel argued that Huari must have been abandoned at the end of MH 2 – so about Cal. A.D. 900. Although she admitted that some MH Epoch 3 pottery might exist at Huari, none could be identified. Furthermore, no stylistic interactions between the capital and regional Wari ceramic styles could be detected after Epoch 2. She concluded that the Huari capital was no longer emanating artistic influences. Its prestige must have collapsed, implying that it was depopulated, and no longer a political center; if Epoch 3 pottery was used on the site its consumers must have been camping in the ruins of the former capital.

Pottery of MH Epoch 3 was identified only on the coast, but even there, well-described materials are scarce. Menzel attributed this to disinterest in publishing photographs and studies of pottery that is not very attractive, but the problem may be greater. Generally, pottery assigned to Epoch 3 represents a decline in the quality of the ceramics produced, along with simplification of the Epoch 2 religious icons, employing elements of the old images as primary themes – for example, the disembodied head of the former Profile Attendant, or Angel as Menzel preferred to call this set of mythical figures. Epoch 3 ceramic styles that have clear associations are the Soisongo Style from Nasca and the Penilla Style of Ica. Many archaeologists also believe that much of the pottery Uhle (1903b) termed “Epigonal” belongs to this time, even though stratigraphic relationships have not been discovered to confirm that these supposed Epoch 3 MH objects postdate objects dated to Epoch 2.

Pottery of MH Epoch 4 remains even more scarce and problematic, lacking clear associations and styles. New research on the central coast is revealing a long sequence from the MH through the Late Intermediate Period, but good associations showing how fancy Wari styles of Epoch 2, such as Viñaque and Pachacamac participated in the process are lacking. Clearly, ceramic chronology is much better for the rise of Wari than for its final phases.

More than 40 years have passed since Menzel’s final contributions to her MH ceramic chronology, and a great deal of archaeological investigation has been completed – even in Ayacucho where the Sendero Luminoso civil war curtailed research from the end of the 1970s though mid 1990s. The abundance of new information highlights old as well as new chronological issues that require resolution. One of the most important issues is to determine what aspects of Wari ceramic variation are really temporal and what variation relates to other differences, such as communication of social identities.

A Wari ceramic with uncertain chronological position that has been implicated in recent discussions of Wari social differences is the Huamanga⁵ style. Huamanga pottery is generally characterized by a moderately coarse paste and matte surface that ranges from tan, to light brown, to reddish in color. Many vessels are plain, but painted decoration of one and two colors is not uncommon, and some examples with three and four colors do occur. Motifs are usually simple and geometric, emphasizing lines, wavy lines, bands, panels, wing designs, step blocks, hooks and horizontal “S” shapes. Vessel forms emphasize several varieties of bowls and plates, straight-sided cups, spouted pitchers that resemble teapots, and flaring-necked ollas. Huamanga pottery is considered to vary significantly from region to region, and archaeologists differ in assigning it to either MH Epoch 1 or to Epoch 2.

Some of the confusion surrounding Huamanga is surely because it was never a style defined by Menzel, but a type that has been adopted by the archaeologists who use Menzel’s chronology and treated as a style without determining its essential description and

⁵ Huamanga is also sometimes written Wamanga.

associations. Huamanga makes an appearance as a ceramic type in the thesis of Lumbreras' student Mario Benavides' (1965: 60-69) who analyzed the ceramics excavated at Conchopata in 1961. The type was formally recognized by Lumbreras (1974: 181-182) in his book summarizing Ayacucho prehistory. It is described as appearing late in the Conchopata sequence, where it represents the quotidian ware of commoners, as opposed to the fine ceramics of the elite, that were more frequent earlier in the site's prehistory. However, Lumbreras assigns Huamanga to the time of Wari's political apogee, not to a late phase similar to Uhle's Epigonal, or Menzel's MH Epochs 3 and 4.

Menzel (1964: 40-41) did not define Huamanga as a style, but included it among the pottery of her more comprehensive MH Epoch 2 Viñaque style. Within Viñaque it represented the common end of a range of variation characteristic of secular Viñaque pottery. Since Menzel devoted most of her attention to fancy Viñaque vessels the common pottery is only briefly considered. However, Menzel assigned Huamanga pottery to her secular Viñaque category, and to MH Epoch 2. This has been supported by many associations as well as several late dates from sites like Jargampata (Isbell 1977) as well as Azángaro in the Huanta Enclave of the Ayacucho Valley (Anders 1986, 1998). However, at Conchopata Huamanga vessels appear in Epoch 1 contexts, perhaps as early as late MH Epoch 1A or very early Epoch 1B (Isbell & Groleau 2010). Radiocarbon dates for Beringa in the Camaná Valley also support MH Epoch 1 for a local Huamanga ware (Malpass 2002). Curiously, a popular context for Huamanga bowls at Conchopata is on the head of female burials, apparently serving as a gender-based mortuary head cover (Isbell & Korpisaari 2012).

Should Huamanga ware be dated to MH Epoch 2, or Epoch 1 – or perhaps to both? Does its significant variability document its long-term use, calling for subdivision into several chronological phases, or do the eccentricities of Huamanga ceramics communicate social information about identity and factionalism? Several archaeologists working with the confusing Huamanga wares observe patterns in the variation that they find more consistent with social explanations than with chronology (Anders 1998; Doi 2013; Fullen 2013; Owen 2007, 2010). To assume that variation in Huamanga ceramics can be understood adequately in terms of temporal chronology may oversimplify MH material culture.

I suspect that issues of chronology versus social factionalism in Wari ceramic variation are not limited to Huamanga pottery. Excavations at Conchopata, and many years of broader experience with MH prehistory lead me to question the chronological veracity of even the key styles of Menzel's chronology, Chakipampa (with its orange variant Ocros) and Viñaque. I do not contest the temporal priority of Chakipampa over Viñaque, but believe that both lasted much longer than Menzel's four-phase MH chronology allows. Furthermore, Chakipampa probably overlapped Viñaque for a century or so.

The first signs that Menzel's chronology was obscuring important aspects of Wari's complexity came from radiocarbon dates significantly too late to accommodate the structure of 4 epochs as well as a transition from MH into the Late Intermediate Period. However, since Menzel defined time periods on the basis of a ceramic style – description and

associations – her styles and periods are synonymous. We must break with this time-honored methodology and adopt absolute time periods in order to start revising MH chronology.

Absolute dating of the MH best places its beginning between cal. A.D. 600 and 700, with A.D. 650 a convenient compromise. Its end is best placed around cal. A.D. 1000 or 1050. Now if the abandonment of Huari took place at the end of MH Epoch 2B, as Menzel asserts, the capital city as well as its imperial infrastructure could not have been functioning later than about A.D. 900. That leaves no more than about 100 for MH Epochs 3 and 4. However, the Wari administrative site of Azángaro, in the Huanta Enclave of the Ayacucho Valley, yielded radiocarbon dates indicating that the occupation continued well into the 10th century, associated with pottery best dated as MH Epoch 2 (Anders 1986). Huari-style administrative architecture at Sonay, in the distant Camaná Valley yielded even later, 11th century dates, although pottery is so scarce that relative dating of the site is very problematic (Malpass 2002).

If Menzel's stylistic conclusions about MH Epochs 3 and 4 are wrong, and Huari continued as an influential center until A.D. 1000, how must the stylistics of Epochs 1A/B and 2A/B be reorganized? What kinds of pottery were in use when? Do the stylistic differences Menzel attributed to chronology reflect other dimensions of variation, such as social factionalism?

There is still more reason to believe that variation in ceramic style was not simply chronological. At the Wari administrative center of Pikillacta in Cusco, occupation also seems to have continued too long, with its beginning at least as early as the 7th century, but continuing into the 10th or early 11th century, with Wari pottery. However, the sequence of ceramic styles was not Chakipampa to Viñaque to the simplified pottery of Epochs 3 and 4. Rather, most of the pottery belongs to the Ocros style assigned by Menzel to MH Epoch 1⁶ (Glowacki 2005). At Pikillacta this pottery seems to have been locally manufactured throughout the entire MH, confusing any effort to date the occupation using Menzel's stylistic chronology. At another Wari administrative center, Jincamocco, Epoch 1 Chakipampa pottery also seems to have endured significantly longer than Menzel's chronology would allow (Schreiber 1992).

Abandonment of the Ayacucho Valley site of Conchopata that Menzel placed at the end of MH Epoch 1 on the basis of stylistic criteria, is also radiocarbon dated significantly too late. While Menzel's Epoch 1 should have ended by A.D. 800, this small city continued to be inhabited until about A.D. 1000. However, pottery of the Epoch 1 Chakipampa, and Ocros Styles continued to be manufactured and consumed. MH Epoch 2 pottery, especially Menzel's Viñaque style has also been found, so it seems that Epoch 1 and Epoch 2 pottery styles were contemporary for at least a significant part of the Conchopata occupation. But Chakipampa and Viñaque seem to have remained associationally separate enough, in

⁶ Ocros Style ceramics are closely related to Chakipampa pottery, and were assigned by Menzel to Epochs 1A and 1B. Vessel shapes and decorations are the same as for Chakipampa, but Ocros is distinguished by an orange slipped background instead of the red slip that characterizes Chakipampa pottery.

Ayacucho and beyond, to imply that some form of social criteria was involved, promoting the use of different styles in distinct social contexts.

Conchopata provided extremely important information about the MH, and Menzel (1964) believed that the initial contact between Tiahuanaco and the Wari heartland was documented at the site by spectacular oversized urns decorated with deities from the Tiahuanaco pantheon. She named the style “Conchopata” and assigned to MH Epoch 1A. It was not until the late 1990s, when peace returned to Ayacucho that archaeologists could excavate again, seeking to salvage as much information as possible before the site was entirely destroyed by expansion of the modern city. New contexts with giant urns in the Conchopata Style were discovered, but absolute dates show that this material is far too late for MH Epoch 1A (Isbell 2001; Isbell & Cook 2002; Isbell & Knobloch 2006, 2009; Ochatoma & Cabrera 2001, 2002). Indeed, radiocarbon dates and stratigraphy suggest terminal 8th / early 9th to 10th century, so the pottery at Conchopata must belong to late MH Epoch 1B or Epoch 2, at least in absolute time. However, it has also become clear that another ceramic offering of giant jars painted with religious images derived from Tiahuanaco sculpture – formerly judged later than the Conchopata style (Cook 1987, 1994; Isbell & Cook 1987) – actually bears the closest comparisons to Tiahuanaco’s sacred imagery (Isbell & Knobloch 2006, 2009). The painted image of the Staff God on these vessels is so similar to the Staff God on the back of Tiahuanaco’s Ponce Monolith that the two could have been copied from one original model. This correlation provides the most precise synchronization of Wari and Tiwanaku chronologies currently available. Furthermore, the pottery jars are also decorated with designs in the Chakipampa B style (MH Epoch 1B), documenting a significant history of prior stylistic interaction between Ayacucho and Nasca. Tiwanaku influence could not have initiated the MH, or sparked the culture changes that initiated Wari. The Chakipampa style, that represents long-term interaction with foreign cultures, especially the south coast Nasca ceramic style, appeared in Ayacucho, confirming the rise of Huari long before the adoption of Tiwanaku religious imagery.

Viñaque ceramics which Menzel (1964) assigned to MH Epoch 2 were understood by her as distinguished by the adoption of mythical themes and elements of Tiahuanaco origin, but adopted indirectly into regular-size secular ceramics through the oversize ceremonial Conchopata style. In her seriation this was delayed for decades by the rigorous segregation of Conchopata urns, limiting them and their imagery to ritual contexts. However, it is now apparent that Tiwanaku imagery was not embraced in Ayacucho until late MH Epoch 1B, or Epoch 2, so the adoption of its religious features and themes into the fancy secular Viñaque repertoire must have begun immediately. Perhaps social processes associated with religious innovations in the Wari heartland account for the contextual separation of Chakipampa and Viñaque-style pottery. Very prominent in the Viñaque Style are more or less straight-sided cups with slightly diverging sides that feature the Staff God’s front-view face. Sometime seeming to imitate Tiwanaku *keros*, these ceramics may have participated in new ceremonial

events celebrating the Lake Titicaca pantheon, and perhaps excluding the ideology expressed in Chakipampa imagery.

To the degree that Chakipampa-style pottery overlapped the Viñaque Style, and survived into MH Epoch 2, archaeologists must rethink inferences about relative chronology throughout the Wari realm. The recently discovered Wari occupation at Espiritu Pampa in northeastern Cusco has a very prominent Chakipampa-style ceramic component as well as some materials that seem to relate to MH Epoch 2 Atarco. I interpreted this to imply direct linkage to Huari in Epoch 1 of the MH, but interactions with a larger Wari region during Epoch 2 (Isbell 2016). However, if Chakipampa pottery continued in use through much of Epoch 2, the Espiritu Pampa Chakipampa vessels could be contemporary with Epoch 2 Atarco objects, and the entire occupation somewhat shorter and later than I originally imagined. Joerg Haeblerli (2018) also argues that Chakipampa-style textiles continued to be manufactured long after the end of MH Epoch 1, on the basis of radiocarbon dates from several woven bags bearing Chakipampa iconography.

4. Wari Experience of the Supernatural: Doctrinal Liturgy and Shamanic Ecstasy

Chakipampa pottery appeared in Ayacucho in MH Epoch 1 as a result of hybridization between the local Huarpa tradition and the south coast Nasca ceramic style. The iconographic repertoire is puzzling in its representation of odd forms with wavy and recurved rays – a group of images called “octopus” by Bennett (1953) – as well as strange beings like a double-headed snake; a humped animal with long tail and feline attributes; a ventrally extended animal with stinger; a fish-tailed dragon with a zig-zagged back and horned head; and a multi-lobed creature with leg-like recurved rays and long whiskers, named the Ayacucho Serpent (Menzel 1964). It seems likely that these odd forms and beings represent supernaturals, or supernatural forces, but nothing described in Andean mythology suggests itself for analogy – except perhaps for an analogy between the double-headed serpent and the *amaru* (Urton 1985).

The religious imagery of Tiahuanaco stone sculptures appeared at Conchopata – and presumably in the capital city of Huari – late in MH 1B, or early Epoch 2 (Isbell & Knobloch 2006, 2009). Three primary icons were adopted and there is little doubt that they represent the principal deities (or classes of deities) of a pantheon worshipped at Tiahuanaco. These supernaturals are generally referred to as the Staff God, Profile Attendants and the Rayed Head, and they constitute a religion that seems to have coalesced at Tiahuanaco, drawing together the religious imagery of a larger southern Andean tradition – to which the acronym SAIS (Southern Andean Iconographic Series) has been applied (Isbell & Knobloch 2006, 2009). While archaeologists have yet to interrogate the iconographic history and meanings of the SAIS, its imagery does imply significant continuity with Inca mythology and ritual. Menzel (1964: 54-55) suggested identification of the Staff God with the Inca Sun God (and Moon Goddess in the case of a male and female pair of Staff Gods depicted on

giant offering urns from Pacheco, Nasca). She also compared the Staff God with the Inca God of Thunder, deity of the sky and weather known as Inti-Illapa. Some Andean archaeologists go on to associate Inca Inti-Illapa with a contemporary sky and weather god of the southern Andes, Thunupa, arguing that an ancient version of Thunupa, combined with aspects to the Inca creator god Viracocha, can be identified with Staff God sculptures at Tiahuanaco (Demarest 1981; Kolata 2013). Be that as it may, it seems obvious that Wari experienced radical religious transformation with the adoption of SAIS imagery – that may also have prompted the decline in the popularity of the old Chakipampa supernaturals. Representations of these beings or forces may have disappeared before the end of the MH, but as argued above, change from Chakipampa to Viñaque style imagery was more complex than implied by Menzel’s seriation chronology.

At Tiahuanaco the SAIS religious icons appear on stone sculptures, especially great gateways and monoliths that represent elaborately dressed men, placed in the centers of stone-walled courts reached by ascending and descending stepped entries. Some scholars argue that the statues represent venerated ancestors. Be that as it may, locations of the primary icons in the built environment suggest that the figures sanctified carefully-defined spaces reached by passage through explicitly emphasized points of transition. Perhaps ceremonial processions recapitulated mythical history, focusing cosmological power on current participants who reenacted traditional ceremonial roles.

In the Wari realm the religious icons were depicted on clothing, and on ceramic vessels, especially giant jars and urns that archaeologists consider appropriate for brewing and displaying alcoholic beverages – surely corn beer (Cook & Benco 2001; Cook & Glowacki 2003; Jennings *et al.* 2005; Jennings & Bowser 2009). Many Wari scholars argue that feasting, commensal events that surely emphasized ritualized drinking accompanied by orations, toasts and pledges, was a key activity in which power and authority were constructed among theocratic and militaristic elites. It is likely that in addition to maize, other ingredients were added to Wari beer – particularly the sweet seeds of the Molle tree (Sayre & Whitehead 2003), but possibly also hallucinogenic substances.⁷

Each of the primary icons of Wari’s new SAIS pantheon consists of numerous themes depicted in more or less conventionalized and standardized form – eye with tear band, rayed crown, severed head, distinctive human hand and foot, profile animal heads of several varieties, a maize cob with pealed-back husk, etc. These themes are composed of

⁷ As discussed below, the most probable hallucinogenic addition was *Anadenanthera colubrina*, well-known in South American shamanic literature in the form of a powder ingested by snuffing (Knobloch 2000; Torres & Repke 2006). A great deal of perishable snuff paraphernalia, contemporary with the MH Tiahuanaco and Huari, has been excavated in desert cemeteries of northern Chile, indicating that *A.c.*-induced trance was common in the Tiwanaku periphery, if not the heartland as well. However, depiction of the *A.c.* plant on large jars from Conchopata, that were surely used in brewing and displaying beer suggests that in the Wari realm *A.c.* was ingested as a drink, perhaps as an additive to corn beer. It is not known whether the hallucinogenic effects of *A.c.* would be counteracted by human digestive acids, although the addition of other plants that neutralized digestive acids, allowing drink-based hallucinogens to work their effects, are well known among modern South American shamans.

standardized elements such as the divided eye, “5”-shaped neck joint, interlocking fret band, chevron and dot, and pendant rectangle. It has been argued that at least some of these themes represent objects from the real world – for example, a maize cob, a profile animal’s head (usually identified as avian, feline, fish, and perhaps others), a trophy head, staff, or an axe. Most identifications are based on easily recognized similarities with real-world things. However, many elements in Wari religious art, especially geometric designs, do not have apparent referents in the real world. None the less, it is likely that these abstract designs refer to something meaningful, as demonstrated by Patricia Knobloch (2000) who showed that a distinctive geometric design (or group of similar designs) refers to the *Anadenanthera colubrina* (*A.c.*) plant. Identification was possible because of less stylized images of the *A.c.* plant painted on giant ceramic jars, in which the distinctive leaves, seed pods, and spherical flowers are realistic enough to be recognized.⁸ Since the more highly stylized *A.c.* symbols also usually depict leaves, seed pods and flowers their identity can be inferred on the basis of similarities with the less-stylized images. Furthermore, many of these *A.c.* representations in Wari art are so uniform that they seem almost like glyphs. Although the specific MH meanings for Wari decorative elements, even those identified with real-world objects, remain poorly understood, the consistency, abundance and hierarchical organization of icons, features and elements implies a system of communication that was probably ideographic, and mnemonic. Indeed, Tom Zuidema (2009) has inferred calendrical information from Wari textile iconography, and Martti Pärssinen (1992, 2003) argues that Tiwanaku art stated important principles of Andean organization. Such visual symbols used as stimuli for carefully memorized orations would have allowed Wari religious specialists to store detailed religious doctrine for repetition in liturgy.

Experience of the supernatural varies from society to society and even from one religious event to another. Cognitive psychologist Harvey Whitehouse (2004) organizes different cultural experiences of the supernatural on a continuum, calling the extremes “doctrinal” and “imagistic.” The former emphasizes accurately repeated liturgy affirming dogmatic canons, and is mediated by a religious specialist anthropologists easily recognize as a priest. The religious experience is usually a sober event that depends on precise and expert knowledge of appropriate vocalizations as well as bodily movements, costume, etc., by the officiating priest, with relatively modest participation of the congregation. Doctrinal religion has the advantage that it can be celebrated by vast numbers of believers, who need only see and hear the service. The experience is highly repetitive, standardized, and easily controlled.

The imagistic end of the religious continuum experiences the supernatural personally, often through trance or similar form of ecstasy that may be drug-induced. The event is mediated by a religious specialist anthropologists would recognize as a shaman, and involves extremely intense and individualistic encounters with extra-worldly powers and beings. Such a shamanic experience is open ended. It can be so powerful that it is

⁸ Prominent depiction of the *A.c.* plant on ceremonial jars that probably contained corn beer supports the inference that the hallucinogen plant was added to the brew contained in the jars.

life-altering but has the disadvantage that it can be shared by only a small group of participants under watchful supervision of the shaman. Even when carefully monitored, individual experiences differ, promoting diverse senses of meaning that are inconsistent with doctrinal religion. This makes shamanic religious experience problematic for centralized and hierarchical societies that depend on theocratic authority to regulate large populations.

It seems unlikely that any society has ever limited its members to a single kind of religious experience, but on the other hand a limited range of experiences seems to have been encouraged by most cultures, especially complex societies that legitimized social hierarchy theocratically.

In South America shamanism was highly developed, wide-spread, and well-documented in small societies (Harner 1980; Wassen 1965, 1972). It is probably the ancient way of experiencing the supernatural among the continent's first hunters and gathers, that continued with little change as simple sedentary communities emerged. On the other hand, the gradual appearance of elaborate religious art and iconography probably represents the rise of material systems of communication within which information of doctrinal religion and liturgical ritual was stored, permitting greater precision and standardization in ritual and ideology than could be experienced in personal ecstasy. In the Andes, art and iconography probably functioned like writing in book-based doctrinal religions. Images stored and organized religious information to be referenced, repeated, and interpreted by educated specialists.

The increase in complexity and expansion of the area where the same religious iconography was shared during the MH suggest that doctrinal religion was an important contributor to the theocratic politics of the era. Religious canons were communicated in various artistic media and ritual events were accompanied by the appropriate material objects whose form and symbols functioned as mnemonic stimuli for priestly officiators of the public rituals.

Although it seems likely that doctrinal religion was preferred in Wari society, there is reason to believe that shamanic experience of the supernatural remained a significant alternative mode of religiosity – probably in Tiwanaku as well as Wari. I infer that shamanic experience of the supernatural involved ecstatic trance that was most effectively promoted with hallucinogenic drugs, especially the *Anadenanthera colubrina* plant already identified in Wari ceremonial imagery by Patricia Knobloch (2002; see also Torres 1987, 2002, 2004; Torres & Repke 1996, 2006).

I suggest that Wari religious art associated with doctrinal religion would not emphasize – and might eliminate – the *A.c.* symbol. The icon of an hallucinogenic substance would represent a form of religious ecstasy inconsistent with hierarchical control and theocratic authority. On the other hand, religious practices emphasizing shamanic experience of the supernatural through personal trance would surely seek to represent the vehicle of supernatural access, that was apparently the hallucinogenic plant *A.c.*

Inspection of Wari art for *A.c.* symbols suggests a bimodality in frequency – either the symbols appear prominently and in considerable number, or they are absent entirely. For example, one famous Wari textile shows a Profile Attendant with 8 *A.c.* plant images on each repeat of the mythical figure (Lavalle 1984: 76-77). On the other hand, most Wari textiles have no images of *A.c.* A ceramic example from Conchopata comes from recently excavated examples of giant urns in the style that Menzel (1964) named after the site – Conchopata. Some of the urns depict a Wari innovation, the disembodied head of the Profile Attendant. All of the Profile Heads are embellished with numerous themes and elements such as projecting canine teeth in feline mouths, tear bands painted around and below the eyes, as well as elaborate headdresses that cover the top and back of the head. Some of these urns with Profile Heads have no *A.c.* plant representations, but others have two of the symbols in each Profile Head's headdress, for a total 12 or 14 of the plant images (compare Isbell & Knobloch 2009, Fig. 2, that shows two *A.c.* symbols on each Profile Head, with Fig. 3, on which all profile heads lack *A.c.* symbols).

It would seem that oversize urns decorated with the same icon, the disembodied Profile Head, would have been intended for the same ritual event – or class of ritual events – being more or less the equivalent of one another. Consequently, I consider it likely that these urns represented competing ways of celebrating the same event.

We do not know the mechanisms by which giant ceremonial urns were manufactured, or by whom, but it seems likely that they would have been commissioned by elites responsible for hosting ceremonial events. I imagine that some patrons commissioned urns with no *A.c.* images. In my mind's eye these elites advocated a doctrinal experience of the supernatural, overseen by a highly trained priest. Indeed, the urns probably carried the information that would be affirmed during the ritual performance, perhaps even mnemonic prompts for liturgical orations. On the other hand, some hosts commissioned urns that carried numerous depictions of the hallucinogenic *A.c.* plant. I suggest that these elites advocated an ecstatic experience of the supernatural, which emphasized the personal encounter each participant anticipated with the mystical domain. Overseen by a shaman, these kinds of religious experiences could be controlled only minimally by a theocratic hierarchy. *A.c.* symbols on some oversize urns, but not others, imply a dialogue between two different modes of experiencing the supernatural in the religious practices of the Wari community.

In infer that religious life in the Huari heartland was not homogeneous. At least two contrasting modes were advocated by elites responsible for highly decorated oversize urns employed in the ritual activities of the community. One faction insisted on decorating ceremonial urns with depictions of the *A.c.* plant, source of hallucinogenic snuff employed to enter the supernatural realm personally, in ecstatic trance. Through trance each participant could at least potentially encounter the deities directly – Staff God, Profile Attendants, Rayed Head, and perhaps lesser supernaturals such as revered ancestors. Priestly direction was unnecessary.

A second faction avoided images of the *A.c.* plant on their ceremonial urns. They probably opposed ecstatic trance and the religious experiences so induced, perhaps denouncing them as superstitious witchcraft, or just inconsistent with community-oriented ritual and the authority of priests. This faction, apparently the dominant group at Conchopata, subscribed to an orderly, and more sober, doctrinal experience of the supernatural, probably via precise repetition of ritual that involved costumed performances as well as precise orations prompted by symbols on ceremonial items such as sacrificial pottery, ceramic serving vessels, festival tunics and other paraphernalia.

Negotiation of how the supernatural should be experienced was surely a significant feature of Wari life. Emotional attachment to one's own religious conviction was probably strong and perhaps even belligerently protected. Unfortunately, information about *A.c.* imagery is currently insufficient to track temporal change in preferences or to observe social negotiation, but highlighting the issue may stimulate further investigations.

The issue of modes of religiosity, and especially shamanic ecstasy promoted by hallucinogens may be even more complex for Wari than indicated by *A.c.* imagery discussed above. Rebecca Stone (2011) argues that the iconic element frequently referred to as the "feather tuft," that are almost ubiquitous in Wari SAIS art, represents the flower of the San Pedro cactus (*Trichocereus pachanoi*, or *Echinopsis pachanoi*), another hallucinogen popular in ethnohistoric Andean shamanism. If she is correct there might have been a second kind of ecstatic experience among the alternative religious practices available to Wari worshipers, unless *A.c.* and San Pedro were mixed in the same shamanic brews. More research is required to better understand Wari religion and its ecstatic components. At present, we can affirm that Wari people practiced competing modes of religiosity, advocating and experiencing the supernatural in terms of a doctrinal practice, and alternatively, in terms of ecstatic shamanism.

Reassessment of Menzel's MH chronology allows archaeologists to reconsider the possible contributions of Wari-Tiwanaku interactions to differing experience of the supernatural. Menzel (1964) argued that Tiwanaku religious iconography reached Ayacucho in MH Epoch 1A, becoming the religious stimulus responsible for the Wari Empire, even though religious imagery remained restricted to ceremonial contexts for 5 or 10 decades before appearing in the more secular ceramic style known as fancy Viñaque. For Menzel, Viñaque is distinguished by its adoption of features "formerly" restricted to the ceremonial oversize Conchopata urns, including more or less straight-sided cups with an image of the Staff God's face. However, it is now clear that the Tiwanaku pantheon was not adopted until late in MH 1B or even Epoch 2, more or less simultaneous with the appearance of Viñaque pottery. Consequently, a transformational religious incursion is indicated for Wari, more or less in the middle of the MH, presenting a powerful alternative to the religious ideology represented by Chakipampa iconography.

Resynchronizing the arrival of Tiwanaku/SAIS imagery to the Wari heartland encouraged me to explore the possibility that a competing mode of religiosity, as indicated for Wari,

might have accompanied the adoption of the Tiwanaku/SAIS pantheon. Indeed, it seemed attractive to hypothesize that local Chakipampa religion preferred a more shamanic experience, while Tiwanaku-inspired Viñaque imagery was associated with doctrinal experience of the supernatural (although the attributions could also have been the reverse, considering that religiosity, including the popularity of ecstatic shamanic trance as opposed to doctrinal liturgy is still little understood for either Wari or Tiwanaku). Consequently, if *A.c.* imagery were absent in Tiahuanaco art (or in the alternative case, ubiquitous) the hypothesis that an alternative religiosity was introduced to Wari from Tiwanaku would be supported; however, this seems not to be the case. Tiwanaku art is also characterized by bimodality in the frequency and prominence its depictions of the *A.c.* plant. For example, the Ponce Monolith, from the Tiahuanaco site itself, is replete with *A.c.* images. They occur all over the sculpture (Isbell & Knobloch 2009:185, fig. 20). A stone bowl, or mortar from the Semisubterranean Temple is also full of *A.c.* plant images (Ponce 1969: Lámina 14). On the other hand, many of the statues from the capital as well as those of Khonkho Wankani lack *A.c.* imagery altogether (Janusek & Ohnstad 2018; Posnanski 1945). The spectacular Gate of the Sun, surely the largest and most elaborate stone sculpture of the Central Andes has only one icon decorated with the *A.c.* plant – the avian Profile Attendant (Posnanski 1945: Plates XLV and L). Attached to the bottom of the eye of the bird face, the *A.c.* symbol appears only once in each repeat of this supernatural on the great architrave. Consequently, Tiwanaku also seems to have been negotiating opposing preferences for religious experience, with the patrons of some stone sculptures staunch advocates of *A.c.*-induced trance, and patrons of other sculptures devoted supporters of doctrinal experience of the supernatural, mediated by priestly authorities.

5. Conclusions

It is time that we move beyond the “yes” or “no” question of Wari imperialism to examine what kinds of cultural variation characterized Wari, and what processes were involved in the materialization of cultural differences. Ancient and modern empires have been surprisingly varied, including spiritual organization and the expression of identity (Areshian 2013). The sacred iconography of Wari demonstrates that religion played an immense part in socio-political organization, and this article has sought to interrogate aspects of religious ritual and ideology through the examination of mortuary practices. Indeed, mortuary practices of MH present an exciting but confusing domain for study that is complicated by different conditions of preservation in the coast and highlands. Also creating confusion are complex histories of looting, and selective reporting in favor of elite tombs. Nonetheless, it is worthwhile to struggle with the puzzling evidence. Consistency in mortuary practices affirms shared subjectivities while changes in burial patterns document social and ideological innovations of significance to human identity (Brown 1971; Dillehay 1995; Isbell 1997; Pearson 1982).

The MH witnessed profound changes in burial patterns as long traditions of dorsally extended burial on the north and central coasts were replaced by tightly-flexed, seated interment. Apparently consistent with old mortuary tradition in Ayacucho, these changes seem to have taken place at least partially under the influence of Wari. But careful examination reveals significant difference between burial practices documented for the Ayacucho Valley and coastal patterns, at least among elite burials for which the data are most detailed. It seems unlikely that the mortuary changes observed on the coast were enforced transformations imposed by Wari or that the new patterns even represent a unified doctrine for treatment of the dead, as seems to have been the case for elite Inca mortuary treatment. While the adoption of flexed and seated burial does characterize the MH, it is not clear how much it should be tied to Wari, especially in its implementation on the north coast.

It is plausible that flexed and seated burial materialized a popular new conviction about death. Some have suggested that the fetal position in which corpses were interred might imply preparation for rebirth. Alternatively, the flexed and seated position of a well-accessorized corpse might affirm its continuing importance in a cosmos that included both living and dead as dynamic actors. If this kind of religious ideology appeared during the MH, it could have become an important feature of Wari cultural tradition without being exclusive to Wari. Furthermore, there is reason to believe that Wari experienced significant change with the introduction of the Tiwanaku/SAIS pantheon, late in MH Epoch 1B or 2. Future investigations should be sensitive to the possibility that change in mortuary practices accompanied this transformation.

Elite heartland burials from Conchopata were interred in, or under, residential buildings, an observation that seems to hold true for Huari and the Ñawinpukyo site as well. On the other hand, cemetery burial, especially in abandoned ceremonial platforms, was preferred among central coastal people. However, both highland and coastal tombs include multi-individual interments that probably represent the addition of individuals over time, requiring the re-opening of tombs. Indeed, this feature seems more particularly Wari than flexed and seated burial. One individual often seems to have been primary, perhaps the first burial, but this is not entirely clear. However, multi-individual interment suggests that some kind of group was affirmed by inclusion in the same mortuary room and tomb – perhaps a kin group.

Coastal MH mummies vary in size, but the ideal – at least for elites – was a large bale of cloth, consisting primarily of clothing, tightly wrapped and tied around the seated and flexed corpse, with a false head at the top of the bundle. These bundles remind modern viewers of descriptions and illustrations of elite Inca mummies – tightly flexed, seated, and elaborately dressed – who regularly participated in public events that emphasized veneration of the ancestor by the living. Important mummies, especially past kings and senior royalty, resided in open sepulchers on their rural estates, urban palaces, the Coricancha temple, and other special locations. They hosted elites, both living and dead, and were carried on litters to

communal religious events as well as feasts sponsored by mummies of similar rank. Elite mummies were displayed by their descendants with great pride.

Examination of MH coastal mummy bales and their tombs suggests that these deceased were not removed frequently from their grave to be displayed or transported to public ritual events. While more data is needed, the most reasonable conclusion is that coastal mummy bundles were exposed from time to time to add another burial to the common tomb, but religious focus was not on the display of the mummy, or its participation in numerous public ceremonies.

Highland Wari mummies seem, at least in several documented cases, to have been cloth wrapped. But they were probably smaller than coastal bales, judging by the size of tombs and tomb entrances. Some highland dead may not have been wrapped in thick layers of cloth at all. There is no convincing evidence for false heads, although they cannot be discounted. Elite mummies may have been seen by at least some mourners when new bodies were added to multi-individual tombs, but for the most part, highland mummies seem to have remained in their tombs – although this may have changed somewhat toward the end of the MH. Later tombs were equipped with re-openable entrances, that, although not large, would have permitted ingress and egress of mummies of diminutive size. Be that as it may, the more important means of communication between living and dead seems to have been via a *ttoco*, a hole in the lid, or ceiling, of the elite highland tomb. This small hole, probably capped with a stone plug most of the time, allowed tiny objects of value to be passed into the tomb, and perhaps facilitated other forms of exchange that left no material traces – verbal, food and drink, knowledge, power. This kind of relationship between living and dead seems to have emphasized private ritual in the Mortuary Room itself, not public display of the mummy. Furthermore, there is no evidence for the *ttoco* earlier than the MH, suggesting that it may represent a Wari innovation.

At Conchopata, *ttoco* do not occur with the simplest tombs, suggesting that rituals they document were reserved for members of the elite. *Ttoco* are known at Huari, and from several elite Wari tombs in Cusco. Consequently, the *ttoco* seems diagnostic of elite highland Wari mortuary practice, and remained unknown in coastal interment. Perhaps another kind of connection was used for coastal Wari burials, but the lack of *ttoco* seems to affirm significant difference between the mortuary practices of coastal MH folk and Wari people of Ayacucho and Cusco, even though central coastal communities adopted flexed, multi-individual burial during the MH. Significantly, *ttoco* like those of Wari graves have not been described for any other Andean mortuary tradition, including Tiwanaku.

Wari ceramic styles have been presented as temporally distinct but otherwise homogeneous regional styles. However, several of Menzel's conclusions are not consistent with absolute radiocarbon dates, and this requires reevaluation of stylistic variations, chronological relations, and consideration of other possible dimensions of variation. Huamanga pottery seems to belong equally to MH Epochs 1 and 2, to have been highly

variable, and to be implicated in the materialization of social identity, conflict and factionalism.

The arrival of Tiahuanaco/SAIS influence, that Menzel identified as the Conchopata style of oversize urns, is now dated too late in absolute time to belong to the beginning of MH Epoch 1A. Following her chronological logic Menzel dated the entire occupation of the Conchopata site as MH Epoch 1. But absolute dates show habitation continued throughout the MH, although the Chakipampa and Ocros ceramic styles continued in use. At other sites, Chakipampa and Ocros ceramic styles are dated significantly later than the beginning of Epoch 2. Furthermore, Joerg Haerberli (2018) reports dates for textiles bearing Chakipampa-style designs that correspond better with MH 2 than Epoch 1.

I suggest that the MH ceramic styles currently in use by Andean archaeologists – mostly proposed and described by Dorothy Menzel (1964, 1968, 1977), but not entirely – are not exclusively temporal. Several styles, including Conchopata, Chakipampa, Viñaque and Huamanga seem to have overlapped significantly in time. In some cases the association of certain designs are surely temporal, but in other cases they seem to represent social distinctions. Archaeologists must reexamine - and rethink - MH ceramic chronology, considering what kinds of social and cultural factors may have encouraged stylistic statements by potters and by pottery consumers, in the Wari heartland as well as in the provinces.

The Conchopata ceramic style was judged by Menzel to have been the first Ayacucho pottery to depict Tiwanaku imagery, representing it with fidelity. However, one of the key themes is a disembodied head of the Profile Attendant – an icon that seems to be exclusive to Wari styles. Some of these icons were decorated with profile faces bearing several *Anadenanthera colubrina* plants in the headdress of each deity. Other urns with similar representations of the deity have no *A.c.* plant images. I do not think this is an accident. Representations of this immortal with multiple and prominent *A.c.* plants appear to affirm the importance of hallucinogenic trance in the experience of the supernatural by participants in rituals for which the spectacular urns were commissioned. On the other hand, similar representations of the deity with no *A.c.* plant images may deny the validity of personal, hallucinogenic experience of the supernatural. I infer a dialogue between two modes of religiosity in Wari society, advocates of shamanic encounter with the cosmos, experienced personally and in trance, and advocates of more sober, doctrinal religious liturgy, mediated by authoritative priests.

Art with abundant depictions of *A.c.* as opposed to art with very few or no *A.c.* representations can be observed in other Wari contexts and media. The same is true of Tiwanaku. Consequently, it seems that both Wari and Tiwanaku were heterogeneous in terms of experiencing the supernatural, and were probably engaged in negotiation of religious practices. This dialogue may have become belligerent in some situations.

Charting variations within Wari cultural practices offers a new perspective on the MH. Examples of cultural homogenization stand beside trends toward difference practices, in

treatment of the dead, in ceramic styles, and in imagery associated with experiencing the supernatural. Some of the variation is almost surely Wari in origin, representing innovations developed during the MH. New cities probably provided fertile contexts within which cultural differences thrived, such as new mortuary practices. But increasing social and political complexity promoted a social landscape with many spaces for new identities in status, ethnicity, gender, and more. The expression of factionalism in ceramic styles seems to have been much more important than Menzel realized. This requires a rethinking of chronology, but also of social difference and identity. Even religion and experience of the supernatural appear to have been contested in Wari society, implying many issues of descent in Wari society, that must become topics of investigation among Wari scholars in the future. The Wari Empire definitely meets Barfield's (2001: 29) expectations that empires were organized to promote and to deal with diversity in many social and cultural domains.

References

Anders, Martha B.

1986 *Dual Organization and Calendars Inferred from the Planned Site of Azángaro: Wari Administrative Strategies*, Ph.D. dissertation, Department of Anthropology, Cornell University.

1998 El estilo Wamanga: resistencia y subversión simbólica manifestadas en la cerámica del Horizonte Medio 2, *Conchopata: Revista de Arqueología* 1: 138-162.

Angeles Falcón, Rommel

2018 Wari Textiles, Vehicles of Ideology, and Power during the Andean Middle Horizon: Iconography of the Weavings from Huaca Malena, Asia Valley. In W. H. Isbell, M. I. Uribe, A. Tiballi & E. P. Zegarra (eds.), *Images in Action: The Southern Andean Iconographic Series*, pp.503-528. Los Angeles: Cotsen Institute of Archaeology Press.

Angeles Falcón, Rommel & Denise Pozzi-Escot

2000 Investigaciones arqueológicas en Huaca Malena, valle de Asia, *Arqueológicas* 24: 63-77.

2001 Textiles del Horizonte Medio. Las evidencias de Huaca Malena, valle de Asia, *Boletín de Arqueología PUCP* 4 [2000]: 401-424.

Areshian, Gregory E.

2013 Variability and Complexity in Multidisciplinary and Interdisciplinary Studies of Empires. In G. E. Areshian (ed.), *Empires & Diversity: On the Crossroads of Archaeology, Anthropology, & History*, pp.1-20. Los Angeles: Cotsen Institute of Archaeology Press.

Barfield, Thomas J.

2001 The Shadow-Empires: Imperial State Formation along the Chinese-Nomad Frontier. In S. E. Alcock, T. N. D'Altroy, K. D. Morrison & C. M. Sinopoli (eds.), *Empires: Perspectives from Archaeology and History*, pp.10-41. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Benavides C., Mario

1965 *Estudio de la cerámica decorada de Qonchopata*, tesis de bachillerato, Departamento de Antropología, Facultad de Ciencias Sociales, Universidad Nacional San Cristóbal de Huamanga.

Bennett, Wendell C.

1934 Excavations at Tiahuanaco, *Anthropological Papers of the American Museum of Natural History* 34(3): 359-494.

1953 *Excavations at Wari, Ayacucho, Peru*. Yale University Publications in Anthropology 49. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Brown, James A. (ed.)

1971 *Approaches to the Social Dimensions of Mortuary Practices*. Memoir of the Society for American Archaeology 25. Washington, D.C.

Carmichael, Patrick H.

1988 *Nasca Mortuary Customs: Death and Ancient Society on the South Coast of Peru*, Ph.D. dissertation, Department of Archaeology, University of Calgary.

Chávez, Sergio

1987 Funerary Offerings from a Middle Horizon Context in Pomacanchi, Cuzco, *Ñawpa Pacha* 22-23 [1984-1985]: 1-48.

Cook, Anita G.

1987 The Middle Horizon Ceramic Offerings from Conchopata, *Ñawpa Pacha* 22-23 [1984-1985]: 49-90.

1994 *Wari y Tiwanaku: entre el estilo y la imagen*. Lima: Fondo Editorial de la Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú.

Cook, Anita G. & Nancy Benco

2001 Vasijas para la fiesta y la fama: producción artesanal en un centro urbano Huari, *Boletín de Arqueología PUCP* 4 [2000]: 489-504.

Cook, Anita G. & Mary Glowacki

2003 Pots, Politics, and Power: Huari Ceramic Assemblages and Imperial Administration. In T. L. Bray (ed.), *The Archaeology and Politics of Food and Feasting in Early States and Empires*, pp.173-202. New York: Kluwer Academic / Plenum Publishers.

Demarest, Arthur A.

1981 *Viracocha: The Nature and Antiquity of the Andean High God*. Peabody Museum Monographs, Number 6. Cambridge: Peabody Museum of Archaeology and Ethnology, Harvard University.

Dillehay, Tom D. (ed.)

1995 *Tombs for the Living: Andean Mortuary Practices*. Washington, D.C.: Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection.

Dobres, Marcia-Anne & John Robb (eds.)

2000 *Agency in Archaeology*. London: Routledge.

Doi, Masaki

2013 Does ceramic style reflect local identity?: The case of Middle Horizon Wamanga Style in Peruvian South-central Highlands. Paper presented at the 7th World Archaeological Congress, Dead Sea, Jordan.

Donnan, Christopher B. & Carol Mackey

1978 *Ancient Burial Patterns of the Moche Valley, Peru*. Austin: University of Texas Press.

Flores Espinoza, Isabel

- 2005 *Pucllana: esplendor de la cultura Lima*. Lima: Instituto Nacional de Cultura.
- Flores Espinoza, Isabel & Hilda Chuchón Ayala
2012 *La doble tela de los muertos. Tejidos especiales wari de Pucllana*. Lima: Avqi Ediciones.
- Fonseca Santa Cruz, Javier
2011 Descubrimiento del señor Wari de Vilcabamba. Paper presented at the conference "Tras las Huellas de los Wari", Ministerio de Cultura, Cusco.
- Fullen, Brittany & Tanya Chikowski
2013 An Agency Approach to Quotidian Ceramics: Style and Identity Formation in the Andean Middle Horizon and Late Prehistoric Sonora. Paper presented at the American Anthropological Association Annual Meeting, Chicago.
- Gell, Alfred
1998 *Art and Agency: An Anthropological Theory*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Glatz, Claudia
2013 Negotiating Empire: A Comparative Investigation into the Responses to Hittite Imperialism by the Vassal State of Ugarit and the Kaska Peoples of Pontic Anatolia. In G. E. Areshian (ed.), *Empires & Diversity: On the Crossroads of Archaeology, Anthropology, & History*, pp.21-56. Los Angeles: Cotsen Institute of Archaeology Press.
- Glowacki, Mary
2005 Dating Pikillacta. In G. F. McEwan (ed.), *Pikillacta: The Wari Empire in Cuzco*, pp.115-124. Iowa City: University of Iowa Press.
- Guaman Poma de Ayala, Felipe
1980 [1615] *El primer nueva crónica y buen gobierno* (edición, introducción y notas de John V. Murra, Rolena Adorno y Jorge L. Urioste). México: Siglo Veintiuno.
- Haerberli, Joerg
2018 Front-Face Deity Motifs and Themes in the Southern Andean Iconographic Series. In W. H. Isbell, M. I. Uribe, A. Tiballi & E. P. Zegarra (eds.), *Images in Action: The Southern Andean Iconographic Series*, pp.143-206. Los Angeles: Cotsen Institute of Archaeology Press.
- Harner, Michael J.
1980 *The Way of the Shaman: A Guide to Power and Healing*. San Francisco: Harper & Row.
- Isbell, William H.
1977 *The Rural Foundations for Urbanism: Economic and Stylistic Interaction between Rural and Urban Communities in Eighth-Century Peru*. Illinois Studies in Anthropology 10. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
1987 Conchopata, Ideological Innovator in Middle Horizon 1A, *Ñawpa Pacha* 22-23 [1984-1985]: 91-126.
1997 *Mummies and Mortuary Monuments: A Postprocessual Prehistory of Central Andean Social Organization*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
2000 What We Should Be Studying: The "Imagined Community" and the "Natural Community". In M.-A. Canuto & J. Yaeger (eds.), *Archaeology of Communities: A New World Perspective*, pp.243-266. New York: Routledge.

- 2001 Repensando el Horizonte Medio: el caso de Conchopata, Ayacucho, Perú, *Boletín de Arqueología PUCP* 4 [2000]: 9-68.
- 2004 Mortuary Preferences: A Huari Case Study from Middle Horizon Peru, *Latin American Antiquity* 15(1): 3-32.
- 2016 El Señor Wari de Vilcabamba y sus relaciones culturales. In M. Giersz & K. Makowski (eds.), *Nuevas perspectivas en la organización política huari*, pp.39-90. Andes: Boletín del Centro de Estudios Precolombinos de la Universidad de Varsovia 9. Varsovia / Lima: Centro de Estudios Precolombinos / Instituto Francés de Estudios Andinos.
- Isbell, William H. & Anita G. Cook
- 1987 Ideological Origins of an Andean Conquest State, *Archaeology* 40(4): 27-33.
- 2002 A New Perspective on Conchopata and the Andean Middle Horizon. In H. Silverman & W. H. Isbell (eds.), *Andean Archaeology II: Art, Landscape, and Society*, pp.249-305. New York: Kluwer Academic & Plenum Publishers.
- Isbell, William H. & Amy Groleau
- 2010 The Wari Brewer Woman: Feasting, Gender, Offerings, and Memory. In E. A. Klarich (ed.), *Inside Ancient Kitchens: New Directions in the Study of Daily Meals and Feasts*, pp.191-219. Boulder: University Press of Colorado.
- Isbell, William H. & Patricia J. Knobloch
- 2006 Missing Links, Imaginary Links: Staff God Imagery in the South Andean Past. In W. H. Isbell & H. Silverman (eds.), *Andean Archaeology III. North and South*, pp.307-351. New York: Springer.
- 2009 SAIS-The Origen, Development, and Dating of Tiahuanaco-Huari Iconography. In M. Young-Sánchez (ed.), *Tiwanaku: Papers from the 2005 Mayer Center Symposium at the Denver Art Museum*, pp.165-210. A Publication of the Frederick and Jan Mayer Center for Pre-Columbian and Spanish Colonial Art at the Denver Art Museum. Denver: The Mayer Center for Pre-Columbian & Spanish Colonial Art at the Denver Art Museum.
- Isbell, William H. & Antti Korpisaari
- 2012 Burial in the Wari and the Tiwanaku Heartlands: Similarities, Differences, and Meanings, *Diálogo Andino* 39: 91-122.
- Janusek, John Wayne
- 2008 *Ancient Tiwanaku*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Janusek, John Wayne & Arik Ohnstad
- 2018 Stone Stelae of the Southern Basin: A Stylistic Chronology of Ancestral Personages. In W. H. Isbell, M. I. Uribe, A. Tiballi & E. P. Zegarra (eds.), *Images in Action: The Southern Andean Iconographic Series*, pp.79-106. Los Angeles: Cotsen Institute of Archaeology Press.
- Jennings, Justin, Kathy L. Antrobus, Sam J. Atencio, Erin Glavich, Rebecca Johnson, German Loffler & Christine Lu
- 2005 "Drinking Beer in a Blissful Mood": Alcohol Production, Operational Chains and Feasting in the Ancient World, *Current Anthropology* 46(2): 275-303.
- Jennings, Justin & Brenda J. Bowser (eds.)
- 2009 *Drink, Power, and Society in the Andes*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida.

Jijón y Caamaño, Jacinto

- 1949 *Maranga: contribución al conocimiento de los aborígenes del valle del Rímac, Perú*. Quito: La Prensa Católica.

Knobloch, Patricia J.

- 1983 *A Study of the Andean Huari Ceramics from the Early Intermediate Period to the Middle Horizon Epoch I*, Ph.D. dissertation, Department of Anthropology, State University of New York at Binghamton.
- 2000 Wari Ritual Power at Conchopata: An Interpretation of *Anadenanthera Colubrina* Iconography, *Latin American Antiquity* 11(4): 387-402.

Kolata, Alan L.

- 2013 *Ancient Inca*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Kroeber, Alfred L.

- 1925 The Uhle Pottery Collections from Supe, *University of California Publications in American Archaeology and Ethnology* 21(6): 235-264.
- 1944 *Peruvian Archaeology in 1942*. Viking Fund Publications in Anthropology 4. New York: Wenner-Gren Foundation for Anthropological Research.

Lavalle, José Antonio de

- 1984 *Culturas Precolombinas: Huari*. Lima: Banco de Crédito del Perú.

Leoni, Juan B.

- 2009 *Archaeological Investigations at Ñawinpukyo: Change and Continuity in an Early Intermediate Period and Middle Horizon Community in Ayacucho, Peru*. BAR International Series 1991. Oxford: Archaeopress.
- 2010 Early Intermediate Period and Middle Horizon funerary Practices in Ayacucho: A View from the Site of Ñawinpukyo, *Ñawpa Pacha* 30(1): 65-90.

Lumbreras, Luis G.

- 1959 Esquema arqueológico de la sierra central del Perú, *Revista del Museo Nacional* 28: 63-116.
- 1960 La cultura Wari, *Etnología y Arqueología* 1: 130-226.
- 1969 *De los pueblos, las culturas y las artes del antiguo Perú*. Lima: Moncloa-Campodónico.
- 1974 *Las fundaciones de Huamanga*. Lima: Nueva Edición.

MacCormack, Sabine

- 1991 *Religion in the Andes: Vision and Imagination in Early Colonial Peru*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Malpass, Michael A.

- 2002 Sonay: un centro wari celular ortogonal en el valle de Camaná, Perú, *Boletín de Arqueología PUCP* 5 [2001]: 51-68.

McEwan, Gordon F. (ed.)

- 2005 *Pikillacta: The Wari Empire in Cuzco*. Iowa City: University of Iowa Press.

Means, Philip Ainsworth

- 1931 *Ancient Civilizations of the Andes*. New York & London: Charles Scribner's Sons.

Menzel, Dorothy

- 1964 Style and Time in the Middle Horizon, *Ñawpa Pacha* 2: 1-105.
- 1968 New Data on the Huari Empire in Middle Horizon Epoch 2A, *Ñawpa Pacha* 6: 47-114.
- 1977 *The Archaeology of Ancient Peru and the Work of Max Uhle*. Berkeley: P. H. Lowie Museum, University of California.
- Moseley, Michael E.
- 1992 *The Incas and Their Ancestors: The Archaeology of Peru*. London: Thames and Hudson.
- Ochatoma Paravicino, José & Martha Cabrera Romero
- 2001 Descubrimiento del área ceremonial en Conchopata, Huari. In I. Pérez C., W. Aguilar & M. Purizago Vega (eds.), *XII Congreso Peruano del Hombre y la Cultura Andina, Tomo II*, pp.212-244. Ayacucho: Universidad Nacional de San Cristóbal de Huamanga.
- 2002 Religious Ideology and Military Organization in the Iconography of a D-Shaped Ceremonial Precinct at Conchopata. In H. Silverman & W. H. Isbell (eds.), *Andean Archaeology II: Art, Landscape, and Society*, pp.225-247. New York: Kluwer Academic & Plenum Publishers.
- Owen, Bruce
- 2007 The Wari Heartland on the Arequipa Coast: Huamanga Ceramics from Beringa, Majes Valley, Peru, *Andean Past* 8: 287-373.
- 2010 Wari in the Majes-Camaná Valley. In J. Jennings (ed.), *Beyond Wari Walls: Regional Perspectives on Middle Horizon Peru*, pp.57-77. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press.
- Pärssinen, Martti
- 1992 *Tawantinsuyu: The Inca State and Its Political Organization*. Studia Historica 43. Helsinki: Societas Historica Finlandiae.
- 2003 *Tawantinsuyu: El Estado inca y su organización política*. Lima: Instituto Francés de Estudios Andinos / Fondo Editorial de la Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú.
- Pearson, Michael Parker
- 1982 Mortuary Practices, Society and Ideology: An Ethnoarchaeological Study. In I. Hodder (ed.), *Symbolic and Structural Archaeology*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Ponce Sanginés, Carlos
- 1969 *Descripción sumaria del Templete Semisubterráneo de Tiwanaku*. La Paz: Centro de Investigaciones Arqueológicas en Tiwanaku.
- Posnansky, Arthur
- 1945 *Tiwanacu: The Cradle of American Man*. New York: J. J. Augustin.
- Pozzi-Escot, Denise & Rommel Angeles Falcón (eds.)
- 2011 *Entrelazando el pasado: textiles de Huaca Malena*. Lima: Facultad de Letras y Ciencias Humanas de la Universidad Nacional Mayor de San Marcos / Golder Associates Perú / Ministerio de Cultura del Perú.
- Reiss, Wilhelm & Alfons Stübel
- 1998 [1880-1887] *The Necropolis of Ancon in Peru*. Translated by A. H. Keane. Facsimile Edition. Hannover: U. Carlson.
- Renglifo, Carlos

- 2006 *Proyecto Arqueológico Huaca 20 - Complejo Maranga. Informe de Investigaciones, Temporada 2005-2006.* Informe presentado al Instituto Nacional de Cultura. Lima: Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú.
- 2007 *Proyecto Arqueológico Huaca 20 - Complejo Maranga. Informe de Investigaciones, Temporada 2006.* Informe presentado al Instituto Nacional de Cultura. Lima: Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú.
- Rowe, John Howland
- 1945 Absolute Chronology in the Andean Area, *American Antiquity* 10(3): 265-284.
- 1956 Archaeological Explorations in Southern Peru, 1954-1955, *American Antiquity* 22(2): 135-151.
- 1962 Worsaae's Law and the Use of Grave lots for Archaeological Dating, *American Antiquity* 28(2): 129-137.
- Rowe, John H., Donald Collier & Gordon R. Willey
- 1950 Reconnaissance Notes on the Site of Huari, near Ayacucho, Peru, *American Antiquity* 16(2): 120-137.
- Sayre, Matthew P. & William Whitehead
- 2003 New Paleoethnobotanical Evidence from Conchopata: A Huari Site. Paper presented at the 2003 Annual Meeting of the Society for American Archaeology, Milwaukee.
- Schaedel, Richard P.
- 1993 Congruence of Horizon with Polity: Huari and the Middle Horizon. In D. S. Rice (ed.), *Latin American Horizons*, pp.225-261. Washington, D.C.: Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection.
- Schreiber, Katharina J.
- 1992 *Wari Imperialism in Middle Horizon Peru.* Anthropological Papers No.87. Ann Arbor: Museum of Anthropology, University of Michigan.
- Smith, Monica L.
- 2003 Introduction: The Social Construction of Ancient Cities. In M. L. Smith (ed.), *The Social Construction of Ancient Cities*, pp.1-36. Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution.
- Stone, Rebecca
- 2011 *The Jaguar Within: Shamanic Trance in Ancient Central and South American Art.* Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Tello, Julio C.
- 1942 Disertación del Dr. Julio C. Tello, por Mibe, *Huamanga* Año VIII(48): 62-63.
- Torres, Constantino Manuel
- 1987 *The Iconography of South American Snuff Trays and Related Paraphernalia.* Etnologiska Studier 37. Göteborg: Göteborg Etnografiska Museum.
- 2002 Iconografía Tiwanaku en la parafernalia inhalatoria de los Andes Centro-Sur, *Boletín de Arqueología PUCP* 5 [2001]: 427-454.
- 2004 Tiwanaku Snuffing Paraphernalia. In M. Young-Sánchez (ed.), *Tiwanaku: Ancestors of the Inca*, pp.114-120. Lincoln and London: Denver Art Museum and University of Nebraska Press.
- Torres, Constantino Manuel & David B. Repke

- 1996 The Use of *Anadenanthera colubrina* var. *Cebil* by Wichi (Mataco) Shamans of the Chaco Central, Argentina. In *Jahrbuch für Ethnomedizin*, pp.41-58. Berlin: Verlag für Wissenschaft und Bildung.
- 2006 *Anadenanthera: Visionary Plant of Ancient South America*. London: Routledge.

Tung, Tiffany A.

- 2012 *Violence, Ritual, and the Wari Empire: A Social Bioarchaeology of Imperialism in the Ancient Andes*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida.

Uhle, Max

- 1903a Ancient South American Civilization, *Harpers Monthly Magazine* October, 1903: 780-786.
- 1903b *Pachacamac: Report of the William Pepper, M.D.L.L.D. Peruvian Expedition of 1896*. Philadelphia: Department of Archaeology, University of Pennsylvania.

Urton, Gary

- 1985 Animal Metaphors and the Life Cycle in an Andean Community. In G. Urton (ed.), *Animal Myths and Metaphors in South America*, pp.251-284. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press.

Wassén, S. Henry

- 1965 The Use of Some Specific Kinds of South American Indians Snuff and Related Paraphernalia. In *Etnologiska Studier 28*, Göteborg, Sweden: Ethnographical Museum.
- 1972 A Medicine-Man's Implements and Plants in a Tiahuanacoid Tomb in Highland Bolivia. In *Etnologiska Studier 32*, pp.7-114. Göteborg, Sweden: Göteborgs Etnografiska Museum.

Whitehouse, Harvey

- 2004 *Modes of Religiosity: A Cognitive Theory of Religious Transmission*. Walnut Creek: AltaMira Press.

Yaeger, Jason & Marcello-Andrea Canuto

- 2000 Introducing an Archaeology of Communities. In M.-A. Canuto & J. Yaeger (eds.), *Archaeology of Communities: A New World Perspective*, pp.1-15. New York: Routledge.

Zapata Rodríguez, Julinho

- 1998 Arquitectura y contextos funerarios wari en Batán Urqu, *Boletín de Arqueología PUCP* 1 [1997]: 165-206.

Zuidema, R. Tom

- 2009 Tiwanaku Iconography and the Calendar. In M. Young-Sánchez (ed.), *Tiwanaku: Papers from the 2005 Mayer Center Symposium at the Denver Art Museum*, pp.83-100. A Publication of the Frederick and Jan Mayer Center for Pre-Columbian and Spanish Colonial Art at the Denver Art Museum. Denver: The Mayer Center for Pre-Columbian & Spanish Colonial Art at the Denver Art Museum.